PDP PRESIDENTIAL PRIMARIES AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE 2018





(Mainstreaming Social Justice In Public Life)

Ву

Centre for Social Justice (CSJ)

17 Yaounde Street, Wuse Zone 6

P.O.Box 11418, Garki, Abuja

Tel: 08055070909, 08127235995

Website: www.csj-ng.org; Email: censoj@gmail.com; Blog: csj-blog.org

Facebook: Centre for Social Justice Nigeria; Twitter:@censoj

Report Written

Ву

Eze Onyekpere, Esq.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Acronyms	IV
	List of Tables and Pictures	v
	Acknowledgement	
	Executive Summary	vii
1.	Introduction: Legal Background	1
2.	Cost of Expression of Interest and Nomination Form	2
3.	High Level Drama on Selection of Venue for the Primaries	3
4.	The Aspirants and Their Resource Background	4
5.	Delegates to the Special National Convention	5
6.	Accommodation of Delegates	6
6.1	Aspirant Atiku Abubakar	7
6.2	Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal	8
6.3	Aspirant Bukola Saraki	8
7.	Feeding of Delegates	9
8.	Transportation	9
8.1	Aspirant Atiku Abubakar	9
8.2	Aspirant Attahiru Bafarawa	10
8.3	Aspirant Ahmed Makarafi	10
8.4	Aspirant Bukola Saraki	10
8.5	Aspirant David Mark	10
8.6	Aspirant Datti Baba-Ahmed	11
8.7	Aspirant Dankwambo Ibrahim	11
8.8	Aspirant Jonah Jang	11
8.9	Aspirant Rabiu Musa Kwakwanso	12
8.1	0 Aspirant Kabiru Turaki	12
8.1	1 Aspirant Sule Lamido	12
8.1	2 Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal	12
9.	Media Coverage	13
10.	Vote Buying	13
11.	Other Influences	17
12.	Conclusions	18
13.	Recommendations	18

ACRONYMS

APC All Progressives Congress

CBN Central Bank of Nigeria

EFCC Economic and Financial Crimes Commission

FCT Federal Capital Territory

NEC National Executive Committee

NWC National Working Committee

PCP Physically Challenged Person

PDP Peoples Democratic Party

SAN Senior Advocate of Nigeria

LIST OF TABLES

- Table 1: Details of Accommodation Provided by the PDP
- Table 2: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Atiku Abubakar
- Table 3: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Aminu Tambuwwal
- Table 4: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Bukola Saraki
- Table 5: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Atiku Abubakar
- Table 6: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Attahiru Bafarawa
- Table 7: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Ahmed Makarafi
- Table 8: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Bukola Saraki
- Table 9: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant David Mark
- Table 10: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Datti Baba-Ahmed
- Table 11: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Dankwambo Ibrahim
- Table 12: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Jonah Jang
- Table 13: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Rabiu Musa Kwankwaso
- Table 14: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Kabiru Turaki
- Table 15: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Sule Lamido
- Table 16: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal
- Table 17: Live Coverage of the PDP Convention

LIST OF PICTURES

- Picture 1: Decorated Stage used at the Amasiemeka Stadium Port Harcourt
- Picture 2: Agent to an Aspirant Confirming a Delegates Name on His List before asking
- his Police Orderly to release Money-Inside the Convention Venue

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

CSJ acknowledges the support of Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Nigeria Office. To Victorson Agbenson, Kingsley Nnajiaka, Victor Emejuiwe and Gregory Okere, we acknowledge your monitoring and information gathering role.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The report reviews the provisions of the Electoral Act 2010 (as amended) on the nomination of candidates by political parties. This is detailed in section 87 of the Electoral Act ("Act"). This review is matched with the provision of the Electoral Guidelines for Primary Elections ("Guidelines") of the Peoples Democratic Party ("PDP" or "Party").

There seems to be a difference in the procedure adopted by PDP in its Guidelines and the stipulations of section 87 of the Electoral Act. While the Guidelines require a Special National Convention to elect the candidate, the Electoral Act demands that voting for the aspirants be done at special conventions in each of the 36 States and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) while the Special National Convention is for the purpose of ratification of the candidate by the Party. However, this is more of a procedural difference considering that the substance, which is about allowing all delegates to vote has been respected.

The report examines the cost of expression of interest and nomination form fixed at N12million and notes that these fees are extra constitutional demands made by the party on aspirants, which *stricto sensu* may be unconstitutional, considering the fact that they are very high. It is the policy of the law that no one adds or subtracts from the clear provisions of the Constitution, especially where such additions and subtractions place undue hurdles to the enjoyment of rights and freedoms guaranteed by the Constitution.

There was high level drama on the choice of venue for the presidential primaries. It was fixed to be held in Port Harcourt, Rivers State. But when some stakeholders sought to change the venue to another town, the Rivers State Governor, Nyesom Wike reacted angrily and threatened the party. The impression was created that the venue would be a contributory factor in determining who emerged as the presidential candidate of the party. He was later to apologise to the party and the convention was eventually held in Port Harcourt.

A total of twelve aspirants contested the primary election at the convention. All the aspirants had rich resource backgrounds. The aspirants and their ages are as follows. Former Vice President Atiku Abubakar (71), former Kaduna State Governor, Ahmed Makarfi (62); Sokoto State Governor, Aminu Tambuwal (52); the Pro-Chancellor, Baze University and former Member of the House of Representatives Dr. Datti Baba – Ahmed (49); and former Governor of Sokoto State, Attahiru Bafarawa (63). Others were former Governor of Jigawa State, Sule Lamido (70); Senate President and former governor of Kwara State Bukola Saraki (55); former Senate President, David Mark (70); former Plateau State Governor, Jonah Jang (74); Former Minister of Special Duties, Kabiru Turaki (61); Gombe State Governor, Ibrahim Dankwambo (56) and Senator Rabiu

Kwankwaso, a former Governor of Kano State (61). There were a total of 3,619 delegates scheduled to vote at the primaries and these delegates were very well known to all the aspirants before the primaries.

To avoid inducement and over bearing influence of aspirants on delegates, PDP stated that it will provide accommodations to all delegates. However, it turned out that official accommodation was only available to its national officers and some of the delegates. Also, Rivers State Government as a host, provided accommodation for some delegates and dignitaries. However, delegates doubted the motive of the State Government considering that the State Governor was massively supporting one of the aspirants – Aminu Tambuwal, the Governor of Sokoto State. Thus, the major aspirants provided accommodation for most of the delegates.

The aspirants also provided transportation and feeding for a good number of delegates. The primaries were covered in the major television houses — African Independent Television (AIT), Channels Television, Silver Bird Television and Television Continental (TVC).

Our monitors reported that the major aspirants shared money to delegates in a bid to secure their votes. Some of the monies were shared in hotel rooms where the aspirants lodged the delegates. However, the aspirants did not come in person to share the monies, they used agents. Some of the agents were bold enough to continue the sharing at the venue of the convention. While some aspirants paid in naira, others converted Naira to United States of America Dollars and shared to delegates at the range of \$5000, \$2000 and \$1000 respectively. The fact of inducement of delegates and vote buying was widely reported in the media. Essentially, money and other resources played a key role in the emergence of the presidential candidate of the PDP.

On the basis of the foregoing, the report makes the following recommendations.

- The fees for expression of interest and nomination for aspirants should be limited to a modest processing fee so as not to place undue obstacles on the way of aspirants in the exercise of their constitutional right to stand for elections.
- Political parties should be properly organized and earn income from a plethora of sources including membership dues and levies. As such, parties should sponsor and pay for their delegates attending conventions by paying for their transportation, accommodation and feeding. The task of accommodating, feeding and transporting delegates should not be left to aspirants. This increases the cost of campaigns for the aspirants.

- Parties should maintain and update their membership register which will include updates on payment of appropriate fees and levies by members and on the basis of this, produce a clean register of members.
- Instead of indirect or delegates primaries, parties should organize direct primaries where all members of the party in the constituency, state or across the federation will be entitled to vote in the selection of candidates.
- Future primaries of all the parties should be monitored by security agencies so as to collect information for possible prosecution of persons who run afoul of the laws.

1. INTRODUCTION: LEGAL BACKGROUND

Section 87 of the Electoral Act 2010 (as amended)¹ states as follows on the nomination of candidates by political parties:

- 87. (1) A political party seeking to nominate candidates for elections under this Act shall hold primaries for aspirants to all elective positions.
- (2) The procedure for the nomination of candidates by political parties for the various elective positions shall be by direct or indirect primaries.

.

- (4) A political party that adopts the system of indirect primaries for the choice of its candidates shall adopt the procedure outline below-
- (a) In the case of nominations to the position of a presidential candidate, a political party shall-
 - (i) hold special conventions in each of the 36 states of the Federation and Federal Capital Territory where delegates shall vote for each of the aspirants at the designated centres in each State Capital on specified dates,
 - (ii) a National Convention shall be held for the ratification of the aspirant with the highest number of votes,
 - (iii) the aspirant with the highest number of votes at the end of voting in the 36 States of the Federation and Federal Capital Territory shall be declared the winner of the presidential primaries of the political party and the aspirants name shall be forwarded to the Commission as the candidate of the party after ratification by the national convention.

On the other hand, the Electoral Guidelines for Primary Elections ("Guidelines") of the Peoples Democratic Party ("PDP") 2018 states as follows on procedure for presidential nomination:

5. (i). For the purpose of nominating the Presidential Candidate, the Party shall hold a Special National Convention in the Federal Capital Territory or any other place within the Federation that is approved by the National Executive Committee of the Party where delegates shall vote for each of the aspirants at the designated centre on a date also approved by the National Executive Committee (NEC).

-

¹ Hereinafter referred to as "Act" unless the context otherwise indicates.

(ii) The aspirant with the highest number of votes at the end of voting shall be declared the winner of the Presidential Primary and the aspirant's name shall be forwarded to the Independent National Electoral Commission as the candidate of the Party.

There seems to be a difference in the procedure adopted by PDP in its Guidelines and the stipulations of section 87 of the Electoral Act. While the Guidelines require a Special National Convention to elect the candidate, the Electoral Act demands that voting for the aspirants be done at the special conventions in each of the 36 States and the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) while the Special National Convention is for the purpose of ratification of the candidate by the Party. However, this is more of a procedural difference, considering that the substance, which is about allowing all delegates to vote has been respected.

2. COST OF EXPRESSION OF INTEREST AND NOMINATION FORM

The Guidelines state as follows on the cost of Expression of Interest and Nomination Form for a presidential aspirant:

- (1) The nomination procedure for an aspirant to the office of the President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria in the primary election of the Party shall be as follows:
 - (a) an aspirant shall obtain the Expression of Interest Form Code PD002/P upon payment of the prescribed non-refundable fee of Two Million Naira (N2,000,000) from the National Secretariat of the Party or such other place as may be designated by the National Working Committee of the Party, and on completion, return same to the National Secretariat;
 - (b) an aspirant shall obtain the Nomination Form-Code PD003/P from the National Secretariat of the Party or such other place as may be designated by the National Working Committee of the Party and evidenced upon payment of the prescribed non-refundable fee of Ten Million Naira (N10,000,000); save that female aspirants shall be exempt from the payment of the prescribed nomination fee.

The party treated fees for expression of interest and nomination as a funding raising issue. Accordingly, the Guidelines state that 15% of the nomination fees shall be remitted to the state chapters of the party and 5% to the zonal chapters². Although it was silent on what happens to the remaining 80%, it is assumed that it will be remitted to the national secretariat. The fees for expression of interest and nomination form are extra constitutional demands made by the party which *stricto sensu* may be unconstitutional, particularly considering the fact that they are very high. It is the policy of the law that no one adds or subtracts from the clear provisions of the Constitution,

² At page 35.

especially where such additions and subtractions place undue hurdles to the enjoyment of rights and freedoms guaranteed by the Constitution. However, the ruling All Progressives Congress (APC) charged higher fees for the same purpose. The Expression of Interest in APC cost five million naira while the nomination form was priced at forty million naira only.

3. HIGH LEVEL DRAMA ON SELECTION OF VENUE FOR THE PRIMARIES

The elective Special National Convention of the PDP took place at the Adokie Amiesimaka Stadium, Rivers State on Saturday October 6 2018. The convention had the purpose of selecting the party's flag bearer for the 2019 presidential election. According to the Guidelines, a Special National Convention shall be convened in accordance with the constitution of the party, on a date and at a venue to be decided by the National Executive Committee of the Party for the purpose of electing the Presidential Candidate of the Party³. However, the decision on the selection of the venue for the event came on the back of a high level drama from the Governor of Rivers State, Nyesom Wike, who had threatened the Party in the event it changed its mind on hosting the event in Port Harcourt which is the capital of Rivers State. He was reported to have said the following words to Ibrahim Dankwambo, a presidential aspirant who paid him a courtesy visit⁴:

"Let me warn the party, if you dare, Rivers State will teach the party a lesson. Those days have passed when they took Rivers State for granted. Nobody can use and dump Rivers State. No presidential aspirant can use and dump Rivers State. We never lobbied for it, we never asked for it, but it will boost the economy of the state. People will make money. Those who are against Rivers people from making money to improve their businesses, will not get our support. I don't know why anyone who wants to be president, will be afraid of a venue. Then you are not prepared for the election. Nobody should dare Rivers State any longer. Enough is enough. PDP should know that we are not a punching bag. We are not a people you can use and push. We are not harlots. Whenever you want, you come. When you finish, you push us aside. We will retaliate at the appropriate time. When you go, tell your colleagues, the presidential aspirants. We were not interested, but having given it to us, you cannot insult us".

These words raised the stakes as Nigerians became curious as to whether the venue may likely influence the outcome of the primaries and if the Governor had any special plans towards that direction. However, he later apologized to his colleagues for the inflammatory words. The cost of hiring the stadium is five million naira per day which was paid for by the Rivers State Government. Also, the silver platform stage as well as

4 https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/headlines/286578-just-in-2019-wike-threatens-pdp-presidential-aspirants-over-convention-venue.html

³ See page 31 of the Guidelines.

the hiring of local musicians namely; Bamidele Sensation and Sam Kita was paid for by the Rivers State Government. The popular musician Davido also performed at the convention.

The venue was very well decorated with the PDP colours. Picture 1 shows the stage used at the stadium.



Picture 1: Decorated Stage used at the Amasiemeka Stadium Port Harcourt

4. THE ASPIRANTS AND THEIR RESOURCE BACKGROUND

The aspirants and their age were as follows: Former Vice President Atiku Abubakar (71), former Kaduna State Governor, Ahmed Makarfi (62); Sokoto State Governor, Aminu Tambuwal (52); the Pro-Chancellor, Baze University and former Member of the House of Representatives Dr. Datti Baba — Ahmed (49); and former Governor of Sokoto State, Attahiru Bafarawa (63). Others were former Governor of Jigawa State, Sule Lamido (70); Senate President and former governor of Kwara State, Bukola Saraki (55); former Senate President, David Mark (70); former Plateau State Governor, Jonah Jang (74); Former Minister of Special Duties, Kabiru Turaki (61); Gombe State Governor, Ibrahim Dankwambo (56) and Senator Rabiu Kwankwaso, a former Governor of Kano State (61).

By Nigerian standards, all the aspirants had access to large pools of money having served or are serving as ranking officers of state while others have also been involved in running large businesses in the private sector. The former Vice President Atiku Abubakar is reputed to be a billionaire and there are claims that his group of companies is one the highest employer of labour in Nigeria. He has business interests in oil service logistics companies and ports, beverage factories, farming, media, a university, etc.

Some of the presidential aspirants have cases of fraud and mismanagement of public resources pending against them in courts or have come under the investigative searchlight of the Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC). The EFCC filed an N6.3billion fraud charge against the ex-Plateau State Governor, Jonah Jang. According to the charges, Jang, a serving senator, allegedly embezzled some special funds released to the state by the Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN). In one of the counts, Jang is alleged to have pocketed N2 billion released by the CBN for disbursement to small and medium enterprises in the state under the Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises Development Fund, just a month before the expiration of his tenure in April 2015. Jang is also said to have abused his office as governor by collecting N4.3 billion from the state coffers through the cashier in the Office of the Secretary to the State Government, Yusuf Gyang Pam. Pam, who is also charged along with Jang, was said to have corruptly used his office for personal enrichment to the tune of N11.5million⁵.

The EFCC had in September 2015 arraigned Lamido, his two sons, Aminu and Mustapha and two others before Justice Ademola on a 27-count charge bothering on graft, abuse of office and money laundering. The Chief Judge of the Federal High Court, Justice Ibrahim Auta, transferred the case to Justice Quadri following Justice Ademola's arraignment and trial at an Abuja High Court⁶. Rabiu Kwankwaso is under investigation by the EFCC over an allegation of diversion of local government funds amounting to N3.08 billion. This was spurred by a petition, signed by one Barrister Mustapha Danjuma and co. on behalf of Engineer Abubakar Maisha'ani and Alhaji Najumai Garba Kobo. In the petition dated May 27, 2015, Senator Kwankwaso was said to have received contributions of N70 million from each of the 44 local government councils (totaling N3.08billion) towards his presidential primaries in 2015⁷.

5. DELEGATES TO THE SPECIAL NATIONAL CONVENTION

The list of the delegates to vote at the Convention is provided in the Guidelines which was made available to the contenders about five days before the convention as required by the Party's constitution. The indirect primary method was adopted with 3,619 delegates expected to vote using the modified open secret ballot system. The following are stated in the Guidelines as delegates to the Special National Convention.

 The National Chairman of the Party, who shall be the Chairman of the Convention and other members of the National Executive Committee;

⁵ https://www.vanguardngr.com/2018/05/n6-3bn-fraud-efcc-slams-12-charges

⁶ https://guardian.ng/news/court-adjourns-lamido-others-versus-efccs-case-to-october-15/

⁷ http://saharareporters.com/2018/04/19/efcc-investigates-sen-kwankwaso-over-divers.

- Serving and former elected Presidents and Vice Presidents of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, who are members of the Party;
- Members of the National Assembly and former Principal Officers of the National Assembly, who are members of the Party;
- Serving and former elected State Governors and Deputy Governors, who are members of the Party;
- All Gubernatorial Candidates of the Party and their deputies, who shall be automatic delegates to the Convention until the conduct of the next State Congress;
- Members of the States' Houses of Assembly, who are members of the Party and former Presiding Officers of the State Houses of Assembly produced by the Party who are still members of the Party;
- Serving and former members of the Board of Trustees who are still members of the Party;
- Elected members of the Zonal Executive Committee and State Working Committees, including those of the Federal Capital Territory;
- All National Assembly Candidates of the Party;
- Serving Party Chairmen of the Local Government Areas;
- One (1) National Delegate from each Local Government Area to be elected at the Local Government Area Congress for the purpose;
- All serving elected Local Government Council Chairmen, who are members of the Party;
- Former members of the National Working Committee (NWC) who are still members of the Party; and
- One Physically Challenged Person (PCP) per State and the Federal Capital Territory, Abuja, nominated by the State Caucus.

The fact that these delegates were known to the aspirants many months before the convention provided the opportunity for interaction and lobby and possible vote buying or attempts at compromising the delegates⁸.

6. ACCOMMODATION OF DELEGATES

Accommodation is one of the major cost items for delegates attending conventions. Many delegates would appreciate a free accommodation. To avoid inducement and over bearing influence of aspirants on delegates, PDP stated that it will provide accommodation to all delegates. However, it turned out that official accommodation was only available to its national officers and some of the delegates. Also, Rivers State Government as a host, provided accommodation for many of the delegates and dignitaries. However, delegates doubted the motive of the State Government considering that the State Governor was massively supporting one of the aspirants —

-

⁸ The Guidelines is dated July 4, 2018.

Aminu Tambuwal, the Governor of Sokoto State. The details of the accommodation provided by the PDP are as follows.

Table 1: Details of Accommodation Provided by the PDP

Name of the Hotel	Number	Rate (N)	No of	Cost (N)	
	of Rooms		Nights		
Novotel Hotel	50	36,900	4	7,380,000	
Le-Meridian Hotel	50	200, 000.00	4	40,000,000	
Hotel Golden	70	50,000	3	10,500,000	
Tulip					
Total 57,880,000					

Thus, a total of fifty seven million, eight hundred and eighty thousand naira was spent by the party for accommodation of delegates. Notwithstanding the foregoing measures, aspirants still provided accommodation for delegates as means of securing their votes. The details of the accommodation provided by the aspirants were as follows.

6.1 Aspirant Atiku Abubakar: The aspirant provided accommodation at the rates indicated in the following hotels.

Table 2: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Atiku Abubakar

Name of Hotel	Number of	Rate (N)	Number of	Total Cost
	Rooms		Nights	(N)
Best Premier	80	200, 000.00	4	64,000,000
Hotel				
Le-Meridian Hotel	50	200, 000.00	4	40,000,000
Best Western	40	25,000	3	3,000,000
Hotel, GRA Port				
Harcourt Hotel				
Total		_		107,000,000

The aspirant spent the sum of one hundred and seven million naira only on accommodation of delegates. Our monitors found that hotel booking by the aspirant was done some weeks before the primaries and the number of hotel rooms initially booked alarmed Governor Wike who tried successfully to use executive power to wrest some hotel rooms from the aspirant. It is alleged that when Governor Wike began to make moves to stop Abubakar Atiku from the hotel bookings, Atiku and his supporters began a campaign to shift the venue of the convention from Rivers State to another state. This was the genesis of Governor Wike's outburst about the purported plan to shift the venue of the convention out of Rivers State. It was reported that the decision by the Atiku

Abubakar Campaign organization to book hotels in advance for delegates was a turning point that gave the aspirant easy access to the delegates⁹.

6.2 Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal: The aspirant provided accommodation at rates indicated in the following hotels.

Table 3: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal

Name of Hotel	Number of	Rate (N)	Number of	Total Cost (N)
	Rooms		Nights	
Maas	50	70, 000.00	4	14,000,000
Central Hotels				
Le-Meridian Hotel	50	200, 000.00	4	40,000,000
Hotel Presidential	50	100,000	4	20,000,000
Total				74,000,000

The aspirant spent a total of seventy four million naira only on accommodation of delegates.

6.3 Aspirant Bukola Saraki: The aspirant provided accommodation at rates indicated in the following hotels.

Table 4: Details of Accommodation Provided by Aspirant Bukola Saraki

Name of Hotel	Number of Rooms	Type of Room	Rate	No of Nights	Total Cost (N)
Hotel	50	Standard room	100,000	3	15,000,000
Presidential					
Hotel	2	Presidential	200,000	3	1,200,000
Presidential		suites			
Swiss Spirit	2	Presidential	100,000	3	600,000
Hotel & Suites		suites			
Danag					
Swiss Spirit	6	Executive	45,000	3	810,000
Hotel & Suites		suites			
Danag					
Swiss Spirit	98	standard	30,000	3	8,820,000
Hotel & Suites		rooms			
Danag					
Echelon Heights	35	Flat rate	35,000	3	3,675,000
Hotel					
Total					30,105,000

The aspirant spent the sum of thirty million, one hundred and five thousand naira only on accommodation of delegates.

⁹ See page 6 of the Guardian Newspaper of Monday October 8, 2018 – "Atiku Joins Buhari in Battle for Presidency".

Other aspirants spent money in accommodating delegates but the foregoing were the most pronounced in terms of their expenditure.

7. FEEDING OF DELEGATES

Delegates were fed in the hotels by the aspirants who provided accommodation for them. Available information indicates that the hotel booking was almost a blank cheque where lodged delegates were entitled to eat and drink whatever they wanted. Even up till Tuesday after the election and declaration of results on Sunday, some delegates were still occupying the rooms, calling their friends in Port Harcourt and environs to come and eat and drink.

At the convention, the party provided delegates and attendees with bottled water and rice in a take-away plate. About 5,000 persons were fed including delegates, observers and security personnel.

8. TRANSPORTATION

Transportation is also another major cost item for delegates and many delegates will appreciate free transportation to and from their homes to the convention venue. While the monitors got information related to land transport, they were unable to collect information related to air transport.

The number of private jets and chattered flights that thronged Port Harcourt airport was amazing. At a point, at the international wing of the airport, the area for private jets was overflowing and had a spill over to VIP lounge. According to eye witness accounts; the number of aircrafts that landed in the city on Friday was unprecedented, up to 12 midnight on Friday, aircrafts were still landing. Some aircrafts landed and as soon as they landed, they took off again, and after about 2 hours, they came back with new passengers. The aspirants and the observed transportation expenditure are detailed below.

8.1 Aspirant Atiku Abubakar: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 5: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Atiku Abubakar
etails Unit Unit Price Total Cost (N)

Details	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 20 Coaster buses to convey delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt	20	300,000	6,000,000
Branded buses with Atiku Abubakar posters	5	100,00	500,000
Total			6,500,000

The aspirant spent a total of six million, five hundred thousand naira on land transport.

8.2 Aspirant Attahiru Bafarawa: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 6: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Attahiru Bafarawa

Details	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total (N)
Hiring of Mini Buses to convey delegates to Port Harcourt from Sokoto		80,000	400,000
Total			400,000

The aspirant spent a total of four hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.3 Aspirant Ahmed Makarafi: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 7: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Ahmed Makarafi

Details	Unit	Unit	Total
		Price (N)	Cost (N)
Hiring of Mini Buses to convey delegates to Port Harcourt from Kaduna State	5	100,000	500,000
Two Branded Buses	2	100,000	200,000
Total			700,000

The aspirant spent a total of seven hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.4 Aspirant Bukola Saraki: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 8: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Bukola Saraki

Name	Unit	Unit	Total (N)
		Price (N)	
Hiring of Mini Buses to convey delegates to Port Harcourt from Kwara and Kogi States	10	120,000	1,200,000
Total			1,200,000

The aspirant spent a total of one million, two hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.5 David Mark: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 9: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant David Mark

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 5 Mini Buses to convey	6	70,000	420,000
delegates and supporters to Port			
Harcourt from Benue			
One Branded Bus	1	100,000	100,000
Total			520,000

The aspirant spent a total of five hundred and twenty thousand naira only on land transport.

8.6 Aspirant Datti Baba-Ahmed: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 10: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Datti Baba-Ahmed

Details	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 4 Coaster Buses belonging to Baze University to convey delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt from FCT and Kaduna	4	150,000	600,000
Hiring of Hilux Van	2	100,000	200,000
Two Branded Buses	2	100,000	200,000
Total			1,000,000

The aspirant spent a total of one million naira only on land transport.

8.7 Aspirant Dankwambo Ibrahim: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 11: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Dankwambo Ibrahim

Details	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 10 Gombe Line Mini Buses to	11	100,000	1,100,000
convey delegates and supporters to			
Port Harcourt from Gombe State			
Three Branded Buses	3	100,000	300,000
Total			1,400,000

The aspirant spent a total of one million, four hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.8 Aspirant Jonah Jang: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 12: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Jonah Jang

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 4 Mini Buses to convey delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt from Jos	4	80,000	320,000
Total			320,000

The aspirant spent a total of three hundred and twenty thousand naira only on land transport.

8.9 Aspirant Rabiu Musa Kwakwanso: The following transport costs were observed

Table 13: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Rabiu Musa Kwankwaso

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 20 Mini Buses to convey delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt from Kano State		100,000	2,000,000
Total			2,000,000

The aspirant spent a total of two million naira only on land transport.

8.10 Aspirant Kabiru Turaki: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 14: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Kabiru Turaki

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 5 Mini Buses to convey	5	80,000	400,000
delegates and supporters to Port			
Harcourt from Kebbi State			
Hiring of two Diana Trucks to	2	200,000	400,000
convey campaign materials to			
Port Harcourt from Abuja			
Four Branded Sienna Buses	4	100,000	400,000
Total			1,200,000

The aspirant spent a total of one million, two hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.11 Aspirant Sule Lamido: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 15: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Sule Lamido

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of 6 Mini Buses to convey	6	100,000	600,000
delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt from Jigawa State			
One Branded Sienna Bus	2	100,000	200,000
Total			800,000

The aspirant spent a total of eight hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

8.12 Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal: The following transport costs were observed.

Table 16: Details of Transport Provided by Aspirant Aminu Tambuwal

Name	Unit	Unit Price (N)	Total Cost (N)
Hiring of three Luxurious Buses to convey delegates and supporters to Port Harcourt from Sokoto State		600,000	1,800,000
Hiring of 5 Mini Buses	5	100,000	500,000
Total			2,300,000

The aspirant spent a total of two million, three hundred thousand naira only on land transport.

9. MEDIA COVERAGE

The live coverage by Electronic Media Houses between 6th and 7th October, 2018 is as detailed in Table 17.

Table 17: Live Coverage of the PDP Convention

Date	Duration	Media House	Unit Cost in Naira Per	Total Cost in Naira
			Hour	
6 th -7 th	8 hours	AIT	5,200,000	41,600,000
October 2018				
6 th -7 th	12 hours	Channels	7,500,000	90,000,000
October 2018				
6 th -7 th	12 hours	STV	3,675,000	44,100,000
October 2018				
6 th -7 th	12 hours	TVC	4,500,000	54 ,000,000
October 2018				
Total				229,700,000

Available information indicates that the cost was borne by the PDP.

10. VOTE BUYING

Section 124 of the Electoral Act makes extensive provisions against bribery, conspiracy, vote buying, inducement, etc. at any election. It criminalises the action of both the giver and receiver of a bribe and any person who conspires, aids or abets their action. However, vote buying is not something done in the open; it is done behind closed doors and in secret. From the struggle between aspirants to house and feed delegates, a pattern emerged that presidential aspirants needed secluded access to delegates for transactions and negotiations that would not stand public scrutiny.

Also, the convention was scheduled to start by 10am on Saturday the 6th of October 2018. However, it did not start until very late in the evening by 8.39pm. A lot of negotiations, horse trading and under the table transactions were ongoing during the period of the unexplained delay.

Our monitors reported that three major aspirants shared money to delegates in a bid to secure their votes. Some of the monies were shared in hotel rooms where the aspirants lodged the delegates. However, the aspirants did not come in person to share the monies, they used agents. Some of the agents were bold enough to continue the sharing at the venue of the convention. While some aspirants paid in Naira, others converted Naira to United States of America Dollars and shared to delegates at the range of \$5000, \$2000 and \$1000 respectively. Picture 2 shows sharing of money at the convention venue.

Picture 2: Agent to an Aspirant Confirming a Delegates Name on His List before asking His Police Orderly to release Money- Inside the Convention Venue



The three major aspirants and the money they shared to delegates have been estimated as follows:

• Atiku Abubakar: \$5000 was given to 300 delegates. 500 delegates received \$2000 and 700 delegates received \$1000 each respectively. The sub total shared is estimated at \$3,200,000.

- **Aminu Tambuwal:** About 900 delegates received \$1000 each so as to cast their votes for him, bringing his total to about \$900,000.
- Bukola Saraki: About 300 delegates received \$1000 each as part of inducement to vote for him bringing his total to \$300,000

The foregoing report from our monitors was also supported by reports from various media houses. Our monitors visited the hotels where the delegates were lodged and interacted with them. They also observed proceedings at the venue of the convention. Reports indicate that the aspirants did not spend money across the entire 3,617 delegates. But they did so in areas where they calculated the inducements could mobilise support for them. The media reported several cases of vote buying and inducements¹⁰. As at the date of producing this report¹¹, none of the aspirants or their media team had denied or contradicted any of these reports.

Premium Times reported the vote buying as follows¹²:

"Senate President Bukola Saraki has reportedly started paying money to delegates at the Peoples Democratic Party's national convention, marking perhaps the first move in an expected flurry of payouts which aspirants are keen on raining on delegates to win support for the presidential nomination. Mr Saraki paid out \$1,000 per delegate at about noon on Saturday, hours before voting opens in the convention, PREMIUM TIMES learnt from delegates, including those who received the largesse. 'We have received our first goodwill from the Senate President Bukola Saraki,' a delegate from Nasarawa State told PREMIUM TIMES. 'It is our first dollars here, but we know more would still come from other aspirants, they have been calling us since yesterday'."

The Punch Newspaper stated as follows¹³:

"Members of the Peoples Democratic Party, who were fortunate to be delegates at the party's national convention which held in Port Harcourt on Saturday, have described the exercise as worthy. This is because they were said to have received thousands of dollars as bribes from some presidential aspirants. As early as Saturday morning, some of the delegates said they already had up to \$9,000 each while they said that they were

2018 PDP PRESIDENTIAL PRIMARIES AND CAMPAIGN FINANCE

¹⁰ According to the Guardian Newspaper of Monday October 6 2018, it learnt that aspirants financially induced some of the delegates.

¹¹ About ten days after the convention. However, the PDP as a party had issued a statement denying these allegations. See https://www.thisdaylive.com/index.php/2018/10/08/apcs-allegation-of-vote-buying-at-national-convention-false-says-pdp/.

https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/headlines/288690-pdp-convention-live-updates-atiku-saraki-tambuwal-others-in-final-showdown-for-presidential-ticket.html

¹³ https://punchng.com/dollar-rain-as-saraki-atiku-tambuwal-divide-pdp-leaders,

still expecting more...A particular aspirant, who had taken part in a presidential primary before, was said to have first offered the delegates \$2,500 each in exchange for votes. But when he heard that another aspirant offered the delegates \$3000, he increased his own to \$4000. Our correspondent however gathered that the first aspirant later offered same amount of \$4000, an action that forced the man who offered \$4000 to increase his own to \$5000. Another aspirant was also said to have offered a mere \$1000".

"It was also learnt that some aspirants gave out naira to the delegates, while a source said states with large delegates got N50m, while others with fewer delegates got less. However, investigations by our correspondents also revealed that other aspirants had also offered unspecified amount of money to the delegates. Two delegates from the North-West, who spoke with our correspondents on condition of anonymity, confirmed they received cash. One of them, who showed our correspondent the envelope that contained the dollar bills, said they decided to receive the gratification as a means of getting their share of the 'national cake'. He said, "We are not going to sell our conscience because of the money. In fact, we saw it as an opportunity to collect what belongs to us from these men. Another delegate from the South-East, who also confirmed that he collected money even wished that the exercise could be called off and another one organise to enable him to make more money".

Vanguard Newspapers wrote 14:

"According to Sahara Reporters, many of the more than 3,000 delegates are said to have received thousands of dollars as bribes from some presidential aspirants. 'As early as Saturday morning, some of the delegates said they already had up to \$9,000 each while they said that they were still expecting more.' The aspirants who are taking part in the primary are a former Vice President, Atiku Abubakar: Governor of Sokoto State, Aminu Tambuwal; Governor of Gombe State, Ibrahim Dankwambo; a former Governor of Kano State, Senator Rabiu Kwankwaso; a former Governor of Sokoto State, Alhaji Attahiru Bafarawa. Others are the President of the Senate, Senator Bukola Saraki; a former President of the Senate, Senator David Mark; a former Minister of Special Duties and Inter-Governmental Relations, Alhaji Tanimu Turaki (SAN) and a former Governor of Plateau State, Senator Jonah Jang. Also in the race are, a former Governor of Kaduna State, Senator Ahmed Makarfi; a former Governor of Jigawa State, Alhaji Sule Lamido and Dr. Datti Baba-Ahmed. 'A particular aspirant, who had taken part in a presidential primary before, was said to have first offered the delegates \$2,500 each in exchange for votes. But when he heard that another aspirant offered the delegates \$3000, he increased his own to \$4000'. Our correspondent however gathered that the first aspirant later offered same amount of \$4000, and action that forced the man who offered \$4000 to increase his own to \$5000. Another aspirant was also said to have offered a mere \$1000"

See: https://www.vanguardngr.com/2018/10/dollar-rains-at-port-harcourt-pdp-presidential-primaries-2018/

For Daily Trust Newspaper, their source stated¹⁵:

"They are receiving the package based on their political antecedents. But the cash is between N200,000 and N500,000 depending on the delegate's pedigree and relationship with the actors. You see, there are some high profile delegates that can even influence the decision of other delegates and even alter the equation. But I can assure you that they are feeding fat."

Daily Trust Newspaper continues:

Bureau de change operators especially those located opposite Hotel Presidential Port Harcourt are having a hectic time attending to hundreds of customers suspected to be PDP delegates who are crowding around them to exchange money. One of the foreign exchange operator opposite Hotel Presidential, Musa Danladi said he attended to more than 50 persons as of 4.00pm on Friday. He said people suspected to be party delegates are approaching them in droves to exchange money. 'Since morning we have been attending to persons suspected to be PDP delegates. They were coming in large number to negotiate and exchange money from us. It has been a good business and I pray it will remain like this', he said. When our reporter visited one of the Bureau de Change opposite Hotel Presidential, people suspected to be delegates were seen negotiating with some of the operators"¹⁶.

11. OTHER INFLUENCES

The two serving governors who contested - Aminu Tambuwal of Sokoto State and Ibrahim Dankwambo of Gombe State virtually had all the delegates from their state in their kitty. The Kwara State delegates and Kano State delegates also voted solidly for aspirants Bukola Saraki and Rabiu Kwankwaso respectively. Further, delegates from states where PDP had serving governors were to a large extent influenced by the choice of aspirant made by their governors. For instance, it was reported that delegates from Rivers State were specifically barred from receiving tips from Abubakar Atiku's camp. They were reportedly directed to vote for Aminu Tambuwal who polled 100 percent of the votes of Rivers State delegates 17. In previous presidential primaries, when the party produced the majority of governors, the governors were usually, to a large extent, responsible for the decision on who emerged as presidential candidate. But there were many states without PDP governors. As such, these states without PDP governors had no arrow head who wields executive power, distributes largesse and with authority to mobilise everyone to vote for a particular aspirant. Also, since two serving governors and four former governors were in the race, it was not possible for the

¹⁵ https://www.dailvtrust.com.ng/pdp-delegates-feed-fat-as-aspirants-lobby-bribe-for-votes.html

¹⁶ https://www.dailytrust.com.ng/pdp-convention-delegates-besiege-bureau-de-change

¹⁷ See page 6 of the Guardian Newspaper of October 8 2018 – Atiku joins Buhari in Battle for Presidency.

governors to arrive at a consensus on which aspirant to support and give the bulk of votes from their states.

12. CONCLUSIONS

PDP presidential aspirants paid N12 million for expression of interest and purchase of forms. The sums realized were treated as revenue source for the party. The money was shared between the national, zonal and state offices of the party. The choice of a venue for the convention raised the stakes as Nigerians became curious as to whether the venue will decide the winner of the primary. The aspirants by Nigerian standards were all men of means and had huge resources to finance elections. Further, the delegates were well known to the aspirants many weeks before the convention.

The PDP promised to accommodate all the delegates in a bid to provide a level playing field to all the aspirants. Eventually, the accommodation provided by the party did not go round all the delegates as the aspirants spent large sums of money in providing accommodation for the delegates. Delegates were fed by aspirants who provided accommodation for them. The aspirants also provided transportation for some of the delegates.

Our monitors and the media reported that money exchanged hands as inducement to vote for aspirants. Money was shared in the hotels where the delegates were lodged while some agents of aspirants took the distribution of the money into the convention venue. The favourite currency was the American Dollar. Governors as leaders of the party in their states also sought to influence the primaries. Essentially, money and other resources played a key role in the emergence of a candidate for the PDP at the presidential primaries held in Port Harcourt on October 6, 2018.

Indirect primary elections select delegates who in turn elect a candidate from the list of aspirants. This is inherently inclined towards manipulation and inducement. The delegates can easily be targeted and induced. But if the election is by direct primaries where all the members of the party will have the right to vote, vote buying will become more difficult as a huge budget will be needed to induce voters who will be in their millions.

13. RECOMMENDATIONS

- The fees for expression of interest and nomination for aspirants should be limited to a modest processing fee so as not to place undue obstacles on the way of aspirants in the exercise of their constitutional right to stand for elections.
- Political parties should be properly organized and earn income from a plethora of sources including membership dues and levies. As such, parties should sponsor

and pay for their delegates attending conventions by paying for their transportation, accommodation and feeding. The task of accommodating, feeding and transporting delegates should not be left to aspirants. This increases the cost of campaigns for the aspirants.

- Parties should maintain and update their membership register which will include updates on payment of appropriate fees and levies by members and on the basis of this produce a clean register of members.
- Instead of indirect or delegates primaries, parties should organize direct primaries where all members of the party in the constituency, state or across the federation will be entitled to vote in the selection of candidates.
- Future primaries of all the parties should be monitored by security agencies so as to collect information for possible prosecution of persons who run afoul of the laws.